WORKING DRAFT Pelagic Fish (Delta Smelt and Longfin Smelt): Conservation Themes with Stressors, Impact Mechanisms, and Conservation Measure Concepts

Note: Information presented in this draft table is a preliminary work in progress and will continue to be refined based on new information as it is gathered. Citations and other documentation supporting the information will be provided in or appended to the table as more specific information is developed. This table was prepared by the following individuals at BDCP technical working sessions held on March 12 and March 16, 2007: Chuck Hanson (Hanson Environmental); Diane Wyndom, Bruce Oppenheim, and Rosalie del Rosario (NMFS); Jim White Randy Baxter, Alice Low, Kevin Flemming, and Neil Clipperton (DFG); Bill Harrell (DWR); Bill Bennett (UC Davis); Rick Sitts, David Fullerton, and Pete Rhoads (Metropolitan); Ron Kino (Mirant); and Campbell Ingram (TNC); and Pete Rawlings (SAIC). To prepare the information presented in this table, technical working session participants were requested to identify known and potential stressors without regard to the relative importance of and uncertainties associated with stressor effects and to identify potential conservation measure concepts without regard to their likely effectiveness in addressing stressors or their implementation feasibility. Life stages that could be affected by a stressor are indicated by a "O".

Conservation Theme	r			Pelagi	ic Fish		Potential Conservation Measure Concepts		
2			Egg	Larvae	Juvenile	Adult			
Theme 1. Reduce &	ources Of Mortality								
1-1	State Water Project (SWP) entrainment	Loss through louvers	0	X	X	X	 Install fish screens¹ Improve louvers Real-time/seasonal operations Reduce reverse flows within Old and Middle Rivers Increase SJR inflows Increase outflow Relocate intake Prevent entry of smelt into Clifton Court Forebay ²(CCF) 		

¹ It is unclear that screening is an effective measure to minimize entrainment losses.

² When smelt enter into CCF they are lost—need to identify methods by which smelt can be isolated from CCF.

Conservation Theme	Stressor	Impact Mechanism		Pelagi	ic Fish		Potential Conservation Measure Concepts
Theme			Egg	Larvae	Juvenile	Adult	
1-1b	Central Valley Project (CVP) entrainment	Entrainment into CCF	0	X	X	X	 Install fish screens Real-time/seasonal operations Reduce reverse flows within Old and Middle Rivers Increase outflow Relocate intake Prevent entry of smelt into CCF²
1-2	SWP/CVP salvage	Collection, Handling, Transportation, Release (CHTR) mortality ³	0	X	X	X	 Install fish screens Improve louvers Improve CHTR process Seasonal operations Increase outflow Relocate intake
1-3	Clifton Court predation	Predation	0	?4	X	X	 Predator management/removal Modify Forebay Remove Forebay Install fish screens Relocate intake
1-4	DWR owned diversions (e.g., Sherman Is.)	Loss at unscreened diversions (check to confirm that unscreened diversions are not being used)	0	X	X	X	 Install fish screens Consolidate diversions Remove diversion Seasonal operations
1-5	USBR owned diversion	Loss at unscreened diversion	0	X	X	X	 Install fish screens Consolidate diversions Remove diversion Seasonal operations
1-6	Private diversions (CCWD, agricultural)	Entrainment loss/exposure to thermal discharge plume	0	X	X	X	 Install fish screens Consolidate diversions Remove diversion Seasonal operations Retire/replace power plant units equipped with off-stream cooling

³ Directed primarily towards addressing post-release entrainment and predation mortality.
⁴ Not enough is known to determine if life stage is affected.

Conservation Theme	Stressor	Impact Mechanism	,	Pelagi	ic Fish		Potential Conservation Measure Concepts		
	\		Egg	Larvae	Juvenile	Adult			
1-6b	Mirant Pittsburg and Contra Costa power plants	Entrainment loss/exposure to thermal discharge plume	0	X	X	X	 Install fish screens Consolidate diversions Remove diversion Seasonal operations Retire/replace power plant units equipped with off-stream cooling 		
1-7	North Bay Aqueduct	Entrainment	0	X	X	Α	 Install fish screens Remove diversion Seasonal operations Consolidate diversions 		
1-8	Exposure to toxics	Chronic and acute mortality	X	X	X	X	 Source control Point-source reduction Non-point source reduction Sediment removal/capping/avoid resuspension TMDL Increased enforcement Modify pesticide technology (shift to less toxic methods) 		
1-9	Predation ⁵	Predation	? ⁶	X	X	X	 Predator management/removal Increase cover habitat Reduce ambush points Avoid future introductions Modification of channel geometry (where hotspots for predation, e.g., split of old river) 		
1-10	Propeller entrainment ⁷	Entrainment	0	?4	X	X	 Increase off-channel habitat Reduce vessel transit through Delta 		
1-11	Harvest	Incidental mortality and removal	0	0	0	0	■ None ⁸		

⁵ Focus is on conditions that create non-natural heightened vulnerability to predation.

⁶ No data is available regarding egg predation.

⁷ For example, cargo vessels can entrain and kill fish in propeller/propwash, pressure change can disorient fish, and wake disturbances can increase vulnerability to predation (e.g., Port of Stockton). This stressor also affects salmonids.

⁸ This is not a stressor on smelt.

Conservation Theme	Stressor	Impact Mechanism				Potential Conservation Measure Concepts		
			Egg	Larvae	Juvenile	Adult		
1-11b	Illegal harvest	Incidental mortality and removal	0	0	0	0	■ None ⁸	
1-12	Insufficient food supplies/location	Reduced growth/health/starvation	0	X	X	X	 Conservation actions under Conservation Theme 6 apply 	
1-13	Disease	Direct mortality, increased susceptibility to predation	?9	?8	?8	?8	None proposed at this time.	
1-14	Monitoring	Direct mortality	<u>0</u>	X	X	<u>X</u>	 Stop monitoring Change monitoring techniques Target monitoring to avoid redundancy Use BMPs for handling and release of fish (e.g., better gears to reduce mortality) Improve permit compliance 	Formatted: Bullets and Numbering Formatted: Bulleted + Level: 1 +
Theme 2. Increase	Species Production (reprod	luction, growth, survival)						Aligned at: -3.6 pt + Tab after: 0 p
2-1	Insufficient food supplies/location	Reduced growth/health/starvation	0	X	X	X	 Conservation actions under Conservation Theme 6 apply 	+ Indent at: 10.8 pt
2-2	Reduced suitable spawning habitat	Insufficient spawning conditions (e.g., substrate, temperature)	$?^{10}$	0	0	?9	Enhance spawning conditions(availability and/or quality) ¹¹	
2-3	Reduced suitable rearing habitat	Unsuitable seasonal location of low salinity habitat Reduced shallow-water subtidal/intertidal habitat Seasonal reduction in habitat volume by unsuitable water temperature (elevated), DO, turbidity (low), or salinity conditions)	0	0	X	0	 Reduce channel velocity Increase flood plain habitat Levee set-backs Flooded islands [Note: if salinity conditions are limiting, then flow-related actions would apply] 	

⁹ Effects of disease on each of the life stages are not known.

¹⁰ Not known if life stage is affected by this stressor, but effects are likely limited.

¹¹ It is not known if spawning conditions are a factor limiting smelt.

Conservation Theme	Stressor	Impact Mechanism	,	Pelagi	ic Fish		Potential Conservation Measure Concepts			
	\(\frac{1}{2}\)		Egg	Larvae	Juvenile	Adult				
2-4	Reduced seasonal availability of adult habitat	 Unsuitable seasonal location of low salinity habitat Reduced shallow-water subtidal/intertidal habitat Seasonal reduction in habitat volume by unsuitable water temperature (elevated), DO, turbidity (low), or salinity conditions 	0	0	0	X	 Reduce channel velocity Increase flood plain habitat Levee set-backs [Note: if salinity conditions are limiting, then flow-related actions would apply] 			
2-5	Sublethal exposure to toxics	Increased vulnerability to disease Reduced growth rates Increased vulnerability to predation Reduced reproductive success	?4	X	X	X	 Source control Point-source reduction Non-point source reduction Sediment removal/capping/avoid resuspension TMDL Increased enforcement 			
2-6	Competition	Reduced food supplies for native species Increased energy expenditure Potential displacement from suitable habitat	0	X	X	X	 Non-native competitor species management/control Reduce/avoid future introductions Improve habitat for native species Reduce habitat for non-native species 			
2-7	Water quality problems (reduced DO, seasonal salinity gradients, suspended sediments)	Impediment/barrier to habitat	?4	X	X	X ¹²	 Reduce/eliminate/control BOD loading leading to low DO Increase flushing flows Erosion control Storm water pre-treatment Modify seasonal salinity control 			
2-8	Levee construction/island reclamation	Surface area/volume of suitable habitat reduced	X	X	X	X	Levee set backIsland flooding			

_

¹² Seasonal aspects of this stressor may be same as 2-4.

Conservation Theme	Stressor	Impact Mechanism	•	Pelagi	c Fish		Potential Conservation Measure Concepts
			Egg	Larvae	Juvenile	Adult	
Theme 3. Increase	Habitat Quality And Availa	bility ¹³					
3-1	Reduced sediment input (change in volume, quality, geomorphic processes)	Changes in sediment grain size, sediment erosion within estuary, reduced dynamics of physical process	? ¹⁴	?14	? ¹⁴	?14	 Increase range of flow variation Reduce levee armor (in-Delta, upstream of Delta) Allow channel meander Transport sediment from above reservoirs to downstream of reservoirs
3-2	Reclamation/conversion of wetlands	Reduction in the surface area and volume of aquatic habitat Reduction in organic production within estuary Reduction in water quality polishing	?4	X	X	X	 Levee set backs Flood islands Increased treatment of wastewater/storm water Increase tidally inundated wetlands
3-3	Land use changes (agriculture/urban development)	 Increased wastewater discharges (baseline and stormwater flows) Increased infrastructure and hard points 	? ⁴	X	X		 Increase requirements for discharge water quality parameters that adversely affect pelagic fish Pre-treatment for stormwater discharges Increased enforcement Reduce amount of urban development Exclude development from flood plains Reduce amount of industrial development Reduce amount of agricultural development Limit the geographic area of development
3-4	Reduced seasonal transport flows	Reduced downstream transport and distribution of eggs and larvae, seasonal co-occurrence of larvae, habitat, food supplies	0	?15	? ¹⁵	?15	 Increase seasonal Delta inflow from Sacramento and/or San Joaquin Rivers Increase seasonal Delta outflow

Formatted: Bullets and Numbering

¹³ Important unknown: what constitutes habitat for pelagic species and the response of pelagic species to establishment of new habitat is unclear.

¹⁴ The possible effects of this stressor on smelt is not known, however, because sediment inputs are a fundamental ecological process, there is likely a linkage to conditions that support smelt habitat.

¹⁵ It is unclear if this stressor affects smelt, however, it is known to be important for Chinook salmon and stripped bass.

Conservation Theme	Stressor	Impact Mechanism	,	Pelagi	ic Fish		Potential Conservation Measure Concepts	
	4		Egg	Larvae	Juvenile	Adult		
3-5	Reduced upstream attraction flows	Delays in upstream migration, reduced flushing flows, false attraction/increased straying	0	0	0	? ¹⁶	 Increase seasonal Delta inflow from Sacramento and/or San Joaquin Rivers Increase seasonal Delta outflow Increase variability, timing, magnitude, of flow 	
3-6	Reduced riparian vegetation	Reduced overhead cover Reduces organic/energy inputs to the aquatic system	0	0	?4	?4	 Conservation actions under Conservation Theme 6 apply 	
3-7	Channelized riprap levees	Increased water velocities, reduced shallow water habitat, reduced cover, increased vulnerability to predation	0	X	X	X	 Reduce exports in localized areas Relocate intake Remove existing levee armoring Reduce/avoid future riprap Employ bioengineering techniques for levee protection Levee set-backs 	
3-8	Expansion of non- native species (Egeria, etc.)	Reduced habitat quality and increased vulnerability to non-native predators	0	X	X	X	 Expanded eradication/control program Reduce/avoid future introductions 	
3-9	Increased water depth (channel dredging; marinas, ship channels)	Reduced habitat suitability, increased velocity, reduced photic zone	?4	0	X	X	 Reduce dredging volume Reduce dredging locations Beneficial re-use of all dredge material for estuarine habitat Restore shallow-water habitats 	
3-10	Island subsidence (future under failed levee conditions)	Flooded islands may be to deep for suitable aquatic habitat Increased risk of levee failure and adverse effects on entrainment onto island, salinity distribution, etc.	0	?4	X	?4	 Reduce practices leading to subsidence Increase sediment accretion using dredge sediment re-use, import sediment, import agricultural waste. Increase organic production through agriculture/wetland management (re-build peat) 	
3-11	Increases in temperature (global warming)	Increased seasonal water temperatures	?4	?4	X	?4	Restore wide belts of riparian vegetation adjacent to channels(?)	

¹⁶ It is unclear if upstream flow conditions are a trigger for smelt migration.

Conservation Theme	Stressor	Impact Mechanism		Pelagi	ic Fish		Potential Conservation Measure Concepts		
			$\frac{\text{Egg}}{2^4}$	Larvae	Juvenile	Adult			
3-12	Changes in seasonal hydrology (climate	Change in the seasonal timing/magnitude of flows	?4	X	X	?4	Modify reservoir storage and release		
	change—diminishing snow pack, shift in rain cycle)								
3-13	Sea level raise	 Increased water depth and further loss of shallow- water habitat Change in flows and salinity 	0	0	0	0	 Reduce rate of subsidence Promote active sediment accretion Restore habitat upstream Rebuild peat 		
		(i.e., salinity moves upstream) Increased flow velocities					Reduitd pear		
Theme 4. Increase	Habitat Diversity ¹²								
4-1	Levees/reclamation	Loss of access to suitable habitat	?4	?4	X	X	 Remove levees Levee set-back Passage facilities Increase flood plain 		
4-2	Levees/reclamation	Loss of shallow water subtidal habitat	?4	?4	X	X	Levee set-backFlood islands		
4-3	Levees/reclamation	Loss of flood plain inundation	0	X	X	X	 Levee set-back Breach channel margin levees Flood shallow islands 		
4-4	Levees/reclamation	Loss of intertidal habitat	0	0	?4	?4	 Levee set-back Breach channel margin levees Flood shallow islands 		
4-5	Levees/reclamation/lan d use changes	Loss of riparian habitat	0	0	?4	?4	 Bioengineering for levee protection Plant riparian vegetation Avoid vegetation removal 		
4-6	Salinity control/compliance	Reduced salinity variability	0	?4	X	X	 Remove/relax existing salinity control requirements Modify seasonal inflow for greater salinity variation Modify season Delta outflow for greater salinity variation 		

Conservation Theme	Stressor	Impact Mechanism	•	Pelagi	ic Fish		Potential Conservation Measure Concepts
Theme			Egg	Larvae	Juvenile	Adult	
	Upstream impoundment storage and instream flow releases Flood control operations	Reduced hydrologic variability	0	X	X	X	 Modify seasonal inflow for greater hydrologic variation Modify season Delta outflow for greater hydrologic variation (add habitats that currently don't have—intertidal wetlands in the Delta and natural hydraulics in the Detla—flow directions seaward and tidal)
Theme 5. Increase S	* 'United State		-1	1 -4	-4	-4	
5-1	Reduced genetic integrity and diversity ¹⁷	Small spawning population Hatchery production ¹⁸	? ⁴	?4	? ⁴	?4	 Reduce/avoid hatchery production Manage hatchery production for genetic integrity Increase habitat (See theme 3); Increase smelt pops Increase food production (See theme 6) Reduce mortality (See theme 1)
5-2	Reduced population abundance	Reduced genetic diversity Reduced population resilience	X	X	X	X	 Increase habitat (See theme 3) Increase food production (See theme 6) Reduce mortality (See theme 1)
5-3	Reduced population geographic distribution	Reduced genetic diversityIncreased vulnerability to impacts	?4	X	X	X	Expand distribution of suitable habitat
5-4	Reduction in independent populations	Reduction in genetic diversity Increased vulnerability to impacts and environmental extremes	?4	?4	?4	X	Expand distribution of suitable habitat
5-5	Increased habitat stability ¹⁹	 Reduced adaptation Reduced genetic diversity Increased vulnerability to impacts and environmental extremes 	0	?4	X	X	 Increase seasonal variation in flows Increase seasonal variation in salinity

_

¹⁷ To address this stressor, the minimum number of fish and distribution that needs to be maintained to provide for genetic integrity needs to be determined.

This is not currently an impact mechanism for smelt, but could become an issue if it becomes necessary to sustain populations through hatchery production.

¹⁹ Species are currently insulated from the historical range of perturbations because of the constrained Delta system. Restoration of the historical range of drought-flood conditions would eliminate habitat for exotics that benefit from Delta stability. An uncertainty is whether or not smelt have lost the ability to adapt to restored variability and whether or not restored variable conditions will favor other non-native predator/competitor species.

Conservation Theme	Stressor	Impact Mechanism	•	Pelagic Fish			Potential Conservation Measure Concepts
Theme			Egg	Larvae	Juvenile	Adult	
5-6	Reduced habitat diversity Reduced adaptation Reduced genetic diversity Increased vulnerability to impacts and environmental extremes		?4	?4	?4	?4	• See Theme 3
5-7	Reduced frequency of chaotic events	 Reduced adaptation Reduced genetic diversity Increased vulnerability to impacts and environmental extremes 	?4	X	X	X	 Increase range of seasonal variation in Delta inflow, outflow, and salinity intrusion
Theme 6. Increase F	ood Availability (phytopl	ankton, zooplankton, macroinver	tebrates,	forage fish	, etc)		
<u>6-1</u>	Reduced organic/energy input ²⁰	 Reduced riparian vegetation Levee stabilization Changes in land use Upstream storage/diversions Reduced waste water/nutrient inflow 	0	X	<u>X</u>	X	 Increase upstream floodplain Levee set back Increase wetlands Point source organic/ nutrient loading

Formatted: Bullets and Numbering

Formatted: Bullets and Numbering

²⁰ Includes organic/energy inputs from all upstream sources through Delta in-flow and in-Delta sources.

Conservation Theme	Stressor	Impact Mechanism	,	Pelag	ic Fish		Potential Conservation Measure Concepts	
Theme			Egg	Larvae	Juvenile	Adult		
6-1a	Reduced frequency of overbank flow	Reservoir operations Levees/levee height Bypasses (reduced flushing of allocthonous material/water does not slow down sufficiently on floodplains/terraces to allow food production on those surfaces)	<u>0</u>	X	X	X	Increase floodplain inundation (increase flow, reconnect floodplains, lower surfaces)	Formatted: Bullets and Numbering Formatted: Indent: Left: -3.6 pt
6-2	Increased consumption by non-native species	Biomass conversion to non-native species	0	X	X	X	 Non-native species control/management (herbicides for noxious aquatic plants) Reduce rate of new introductions Increase primary and secondary production Provide habitat conditions favoring native species Provide habitat conditions disfavoring non-native species²¹ Increase harvest of non-native sport/commercial predator species (Need consideration for the relative importance of predators/competitors) 	Formatted: Bullets and Numbering Formatted: Indent: Left: -3.6 pt
6-3	Increased diversion of nutrients/production out of estuary	Removal of organic carbon and nutrients from estuary resulting in reduced primary and secondary production	<u>0</u>	<u>X</u>	X	X	 Increase organic production Reduce seasonal diversions upstream, Delta agricultural diversions, decrease or relocate SWP/CVP exports Screen to size/type that precludes entrainment of large zooplankton 	Formatted: Bullets and Numbering

²¹ The feasibility of controlling non-natives is questionable. May be able to manipulate habitats to create conditions adverse to non-native species, but the effectiveness of this approach is questionable.

Conservation Theme	Stressor	Impact Mechanism		Pelagi	ic Fish		Potential Conservation Measure Concepts		
Theme			Egg	Larvae	Juvenile	Adult			
6-4	Increased competition among species	Reduction in densities/abundance of native or suitable prey	0	X	X	X	 Non-native species control/management Reduce rate of new introductions Provide habitat conditions favoring native species Provide habitat disfavoring non-native species Increase harvest of non-native sport/commercial competitor species (e.g., early life stages of bass controlled by removal of adult life stages) 	•	Formatted: Bullets and Numbering
6-5	Increased net channel velocities/reduced hydrologic residence time	Reduction in food abundance (time for primary/secondary production is too short)	<u>0</u>	X	X	X	 Reduce exports Increase channel cross-sectional area (e.g., wide and shallow) Relocate intake Recreate dendritic channels, blocking channels Increase channel roughness 	4	Formatted: Bullets and Numbering
6-6	Increased water depths relative to the photic zone (area for primary production is lowered)	Reduced primary production	<u>0</u>	<u>X</u>	X	X	 Levee set-backs Flood islands Promote active sediment accretions (create shallow areas that increases photic area) 	4	Formatted: Bullets and Numbering

Citations

Citations and other documentation to support the information provided in this table will be identified and provided in or appended to this table.